

Report of Director of City Development and WYCA

Report to Scrutiny Board (City Development)

Date: 23rd November 2016

Subject: Inquiry into the Development of NGT

Are specific electoral Wards affected? If relevant, name(s) of Ward(s):	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Are there implications for equality and diversity and cohesion and integration?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Is the decision eligible for Call-In?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Does the report contain confidential or exempt information? If relevant, Access to Information Procedure Rule number: Appendix number:	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

Summary of main issues

1. The Leader of the Council has formally requested Scrutiny Board to “consider undertaking a Scrutiny Inquiry into the role of the Council, the West Yorkshire Combined Authority(WYCA)/METRO and the city’s public transport operators in relation to the decisions for both NGT and Supertram.”
2. The Inquiry will consider the development of both projects and what lessons can be learned to inform future decisions on major transport projects in the City
3. Detailed background information was provided at the July and September Scrutiny meetings. This report provides further background and additional information requested at these meetings.
4. The Council is currently undertaking a city-wide “Conversation” on the future of transport in Leeds to develop a future transport strategy for the city.

Recommendations

1. Members are requested to note and comment on this report.

1. Purpose of this report

- 1.1 This report provides Members with background information on the development of the Supertram and NGT projects. It also provides an update on the new Transport Strategy emerging from the Transport Summit held on 10th June and the ongoing city wide Conversation on Transport.

2. Background information

- 2.1 Leeds Supertram formed a key element of the 1991 Leeds Transport Strategy. The Department for Transport (DfT) granted full network approval in March 2001, but in November 2005 the project was cancelled by the DfT on the grounds of affordability.
- 2.4 A high quality bus alternative to Supertram was subsequently developed by the Promoters, Leeds and Metro in conjunction with the DfT. This was to become a Trolley Bus proposal known as New Generation Transport (NGT) which gained Programme Entry Approval from the DfT in 2010 and again in 2012.
- 2.5 Following a public inquiry into NGT held in 2014 the DfT announced on the 12th May 2016 that the Transport and Works Act Order (TWAO) application had not been granted. However in an unprecedented announcement the DfT did still award the £173.5m allocated to Leeds for public transport projects in the City.
- 2.6 More detailed background information was given in the July and September 2016 Scrutiny reports.

3 Main Issues

3.1 Leeds Transport Summit / Conversation on Leeds Transport Strategy

- 3.1.1 Leeds City Council, in partnership with WYCA, are developing a longer term strategic approach to transport in the city through a conversation initiated by the Transport Summit. The first phase of which is focused on securing the promised £173.5m from the Government. Progression of the Transport Conversation and Transport Strategy spend is to be reported to Executive Board on the 14th December, with a subsequent DfT submission before Christmas. This first phase will sit within a wider context of the £1 billion of transport schemes identified through the Transport Fund and the development of a longer term strategy for Leeds next year.
- 3.1.2 The on-line survey bit.ly/TransportLeeds closed on the 11th November with over 7,500 responses. Leeds and the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) have developed a child friendly questionnaire for distribution through the Child Friendly networks. The deadline was the 21st October.
- 3.1.3 The online survey has continued to be promoted including through a city wide circulation of the postcards to all households (352,000) in Leeds. Paper copies have been made available at One Stop Centres and Community Hubs along with copies being sent directly to access group members without online access.

Copies are also being made available at community meetings and workshops, with freepost envelopes.

- 3.1.4 A wide range of marketing has been employed including advertising on the radio, buses local rail stations, digital screens, social media and press releases. There has been a high level of Facebook activity with over 190,000 'Facebook impressions' on peoples newsfeeds (number of times advert viewed), with over 5,500 click throughs to the web page. Facebook and Twitter have also been used to promote the community events and encourage participation.
- 3.1.5 The Transport Conversation has been taking place concurrently with the West Yorkshire Combined Authorities (WYCA) Transport and Bus strategy consultation. The questionnaire deadline was the 21st October. Consequently there has been the opportunity to work jointly for example at the majority of the 23 Leeds Drop in events for the Bus and Transport Strategy, officers from Highways have attended.
- 3.1.6 Following on from the Transport Summit workshop, two further workshops (15th and 20th September) were attended by a wide range of stakeholders (over 80 attended). Additional workshops and presentations have taken place with key stakeholders for example, the Physical and Sensory Impairment group, the Millennials, Leeds Sustainable Development Group, Youth Forum workshop with youth groups (27th October and 14th Nov) and Older Peoples Forum groups (28th October and 7th November). As well as one to ones with Operators, Business, Special interest User Groups, Access and equality groups (including the BME Hub, Access and Use ability group, Deaf Forum, equalities assembly, LGBT Hub, Women Live Leeds (tbc).
- 3.1.7 For the Community Committees, presentations and workshops have been undertaken at
 - 7 Community Committees to date (from the 5th – 22nd September)
 - 10 Community Committees workshops to be undertaken (6th Sept to 8th November)
 - 5 meetings with Forums and themed groups
- 3.1.8 A Cross Party Members group (chaired by Cllr Wakefield) met on 6th October and the 10th November. The Independent Panel of experts met on October 27th with a further meeting planned for the 24th November. Details of the Panel are given in Appendix A
- 3.1.9 Aecom have been commissioned to provide an independent analysis of the feedback from the questionnaire and conversation. Interim feedback on the consultation to date will be reported through to Executive Board (14th December) and will inform the basis for a strategic case for the DfT.

3.1.10 Next Steps:

- Executive Board report in December followed by the submission of a strategic case for the allocated funds to Government before the end of the year.
- Continuing to build to develop the conversation to focus on the emerging strategy and issues and to develop a longer term strategic prospectus for the city alongside the completion of the new West Yorkshire Transport Strategy next year.
- It is expected that the final prospectus will be reported back to Executive Board during 2017 which will include the final results of the questionnaire and Conversation.

3.2 Experience of Advisors

3.2.1 A number of Advisors were employed to assist in the delivery of NGT. The advisors were selected through a full OJEU procurement process in Summer 2008. The advisors selected had considerable experience and expertise in the delivery, including the TWAO process, of the largest rapid transit schemes in the UK including Manchester Metrolink, Nottingham NET, Blackpool Tramway, Midland Metro and London Tramlink as well as on bus based systems including Leigh (Manchester) and Luton Dunstable. Each of these advisors who are listed below have provided a statement of their expertise (see Appendices as indicated):

- i. Mott MacDonald: Engineering, Operational and Environmental advice and design (Appendix B);
- ii. Steer Davies Gleave (SDG); Developed the Value for Money (Economic Case) and Financial Case for the NGT Business Case (Appendix C);
- iii. Bircham Dyson Bell (BDB): Legal Advice in relation to the promotion of a TWAO (Appendix D);
- iv. Aecom: Development of the Leeds Transport Model to forecast demand for NGT (Appendix E); and
- v. KPMG: Developed the procurement strategy for NGT (Appendix F).

4 Corporate Considerations

4.1 Consultation and Engagement

- 4.1.1 Extensive Consultation was carried out on both Supertram and NGT. In addition to the formal requirements of the TWAO process, consultation and engagement has been carried out on NGT including:
- Feasibility consultation in 2008

- Consultation carried out in 2009/2010 involving 21 days of exhibitions along the route – showed strong support for the proposals.
- Area Committee presentations.
- Briefing to the main political groups September-November 2012
- 26 Public Consultation events held October 2012 - July 2013: over 1,100 attendees
- 52,000 leaflets distributed
- Quarterly E-newsletter with circulation of around 450 people
- Meetings with Businesses, access groups, Tenant organisations, Civic Trust, Cycling Forum and the Universities
- Meetings with Councillors and MPs
- Engagement with officers from across the Council.
- Meetings with affected land and property owners along the route.
- City Plans Panel meetings devoted to the NGT proposals.

4.1.2 The city-wide conversation about the future of transport in Leeds is detailed in Section 3.1 of this report.

4.2 Equality and Diversity / Cohesion and Integration

4.2.1 A full equality impact assessment was undertaken on the Project and accompanied the TWAO application. The assessment concluded by stating that the provision of a new and frequent public transport service in the form of a trolleybus network would improve access to a whole range of social and economic resources along the route including the City Centre, Leeds' two universities, a major hospital, and a whole range of other facilities from shops to places of worship. It also acknowledged however that the construction and implementation phases may have a negative effect on a range of local socio-demographic groups and communities. The report contained a number of recommendations to mitigate the negative impacts.

4.3 Council policies and Best Council Plan

4.3.1 This inquiry will support objectives as defined in The Vision for Leeds 2011 – 2030 and the Best Council Plan 2015-20.

4.4 Resources and value for money

4.4.1 This report has no specific resource and value for money implications

4.5 Legal Implications, Access to Information and Call In

4.5.1 This report has no specific legal or access to information implications

4.6 Risk Management

4.6.1 This report has no risk management implications.

5 Conclusions

- 5.1 The Supertram and NGT proposals were developed over a period of around 25 years. At all stages the Department for Transport were fully engaged and awarded both schemes formal approvals at key stages of their development. Key decisions were taken by DfT throughout the process which led to fundamental changes to the scheme. Several led to adverse comments / criticisms in the Inspector's final report.
- 5.2 During this time period the schemes were supported by the major political parties at both national and local level.
- 5.2 The Department for Transport cancelled both Supertram and after 15 and 10 years respectively had been spent in development.
- 5.3 This report has presented an overview of the background to the development of both Supertram and NGT and explores some of the reasons behind the decision.
- 5.4 The Transport Conversation on the City's Transport Strategy has recently concluded.

6 Recommendations

- 6.1 Members are requested to note and comment on this report.

7 Background documents¹

7.1 Appendices

Appendix A – Membership of the Advisory Panel

Appendix B – Mott Macdonald Statement of Experience and Expertise

Appendix C - SDG Statement of Experience and Expertise

Appendix D - BDB Statement of Experience and Expertise

Appendix E - Aecom Statement of Experience and Expertise

Appendix F – KPMG Statement of Experience and Expertise

¹ The background documents listed in this section are available to download from the Council's website, unless they contain confidential or exempt information. The list of background documents does not include published works.